

LEE ALLEN
(contact info redacted)

April 6, 2012

Governor Gary R. Herbert
Utah State Capitol Complex
350 North State Street, Suite 200
PO Box 142220
Salt Lake City, Utah 84114-2220

Re: HCR 5, 2012 General Session

Dear Governor Herbert:

As a World War II civilian prisoner of the Japanese in real concentration camps and a retired U.S. Army Lieutenant Colonel, it was disappointing to see the State of Utah use language that denigrates the efforts of our nation in its wartime trial as is done by HCR 5. Also, although it is commendable to honor Japanese-American service in World War II, to resort to claims that present as fact a large number of exaggerated and outright contrived accomplishments attributable to Japanese-American service is not.

I can only conclude that HCR 5 was accepted as written because the true historical information was unknown to those who supported it. Clearly, the service rendered by Japanese-Americans was exceptional and needs no embellishment. Indeed, doing so detracts from their service and reputation.

I have attached an annotated version of HCR5 to correct the historical inaccuracies. I have included citations for my sources. In the future I urge that the State of Utah not use its authority and good faith to validate historical claims without first checking to make sure they are true.

Sincerely,

Lee Allen

Copies: Each representative and senator.

**CONCURRENT RESOLUTION DESIGNATING FEBRUARY
18, 2012 CONGRESSIONAL GOLD MEDAL DAY FOR
CERTAIN VETERANS**

2012 GENERAL SESSION

STATE OF UTAH

Chief Sponsor: Curtis Oda

Senate Sponsor: Ross I. Romero

8	Cosponsors:	Janice M. Fisher	Daniel McCay
9	Johnny Anderson	Craig A. Frank	Kay L. McIff
10	Patrice M. Arent	Gage Froerer	Ronda Rudd Menlove
11	Stewart Barlow	Brad J. Galvez	Michael T. Morley
12	Roger E. Barrus	Francis D. Gibson	Carol Spackman Moss
13	Jim Bird	Richard A. Greenwood	Merlynn T. Newbold
14	Joel K. Briscoe	Keith Grover	Jim Nielson
15	Derek E. Brown	Stephen G. Handy	Michael E. Noel
16	Melvin R. Brown	Wayne A. Harper	Patrick Painter
17	David G. Butterfield	Lynn N. Hemingway	Lee B. Perry
18	Rebecca Chavez-Houck	Neal B. Hendrickson	Jeremy A. Peterson
19	LaVar Christensen	Christopher N. Herrod	Val L. Peterson
20	Tim M. Cosgrove	Gregory H. Hughes	Dixon M. Pitcher
21	Fred C. Cox	Eric K. Hutchings	Marie H. Poulson
22	Bradley M. Daw	Don L. Ipson	Kraig Powell
23	Brad L. Dee	Ken Ivory	Paul Ray
24	John Dougall	Brian S. King	Douglas Sagers
25	Brian Doughty	Todd E. Kiser	Stephen E. Sandstrom
26	Jack R. Draxler	Bradley G. Last	Dean Sanpei
27	Susan Duckworth	David Litvack	Jennifer M. Seelig
28	James A. Dunnigan	Rebecca D. Lockhart	V. Lowry Snow
29	Rebecca P. Edwards	John G. Mathis	Steve Eliason

30	Kenneth W. Sumsion	Mark A. Wheatley	Brad R. Wilson
31	Evan J. Vickers	Ryan D. Wilcox	Bill Wright
32	Christine F. Watkins	Larry B. Wiley	R. Curt Webb

33

34 **LONG TITLE**

35 **General Description:**

36 This concurrent resolution of the Legislature and the Governor designates February 18,
37 2012, as Utah's Congressional Gold Medal Day.

38 **Highlighted Provisions:**

39 This resolution:

40 designates February 18, 2012, as Utah's Congressional Gold Medal Day for the
41 Veterans of the 100th Infantry Battalion, the 442nd Regimental Combat Team, and
42 the Nisei Military Intelligence Service, including those from Utah.

43 **Special Clauses:**

44 None

45

46 *Be it resolved by the Legislature of the state of Utah, the Governor concurring therein:*

47 WHEREAS, at the inception of World War II, pursuant to Executive Order 9066,
48 120,000 people of Japanese ancestry, including American citizens, were forcibly removed from
49 the West Coast of the United States and incarcerated in one of the United States of America's
50 infamous concentration camps;

Having spent over three years in real concentration camps in the Philippines, I can assure you that not only were the American relocation centers not concentration camps, they were not "infamous concentration camps." The relocation centers provided adequate food, shelter and medical treatment; schools, banks, post offices, stores, beauty parlors, recreation halls, paid jobs and an opportunity to leave when work was found in interior states, which approximately 40,000 did. They also facilitated approximately 4,000 students, regardless of citizenship, to attend college in the interior.

When it was time to close the centers, the War Relocation Authority faced a "friendly opposition" to the closing and resettling of the occupants which "worked with great persistence and ingenuity throughout the summer and fall [1945] to prevent WRA from carrying out its schedule of center closing." "It was 'spark-plugged' and stimulated, the WRA feels certain, to a very large degree by alert young Nisei [U.S. citizens] who had relocated throughout the country and were enjoying the financial advantage of having their parents maintained at government expense in relocation centers."

Source: *WRA: A Story of Human Conservation*, V.9, AMS Press, New York, 1975, p. 149. (Reprint of the 1946 ed. Published by the U.S. Govt. Print. Office, Washington.)
<http://internmentarchives.com/showdoc.php?docid=187&pagenum=166>

After the “infamous concentration camps” were closed, a banquet was held at the Roosevelt Hotel in New York City on May 22, 1946 by the Japanese- American Citizens League and “their friends” to honor Dillon S. Meyer, the man who ran the “infamous concentration camps.” A scroll presented on that occasion described Mr. Meyer as “American and champion of human rights and common decency” who provided “courageous and inspired leadership as National Director of the War Relocation Authority.” (Such recognition was a first, no doubt, in the history of “infamous concentration camps.”)

Source: *Uprooted Americans*, Dillon S. Meyer, The University of Arizona Press, 1971, Appendix O, p. 342-343.

51 WHEREAS, the Nisei, second generation American-born citizens, were classified 4C,
52 meaning enemy alien, unfit for military service because of nationality or ancestry;

The Selective Service Classification 4C did not mean enemy aliens. It meant “alien, neutral alien.” The classification “enemy alien” or “alien enemy” was given to citizens of countries at war with the United States who were living in the U.S. and was so done for citizens of Japan by Presidential Proclamation 2525, dated December 8, 1941. No U.S. citizens were ever classified as “enemy aliens.” Approximately 5,600 U.S. citizens of Japanese descent who renounced their U.S. citizenship during the war were immediately classified as enemy aliens under the authority of PP 2525.
<http://www.internmentarchives.com/specialreports/smithsonian/smithsonian10.php>

53 WHEREAS, these individuals were discriminated against and prevented from actively
54 serving in the United States military;

The classification of 4C was given Nisei (U.S. citizens) because an intercepted message from the Japanese Consulate in Los Angeles to Tokyo on May 9, 1941 revealed Nisei serving in the military were part of Japan’s intelligence collection plan. Nisei were also prohibited from working in aircraft plants because the same message revealed that the Japanese consul was using them for “intelligence purposes.”

Source: Msg #67 From Los Angeles to Tokyo, May 9, 1941 reproduced in *Magic: The Untold Story*, David D. Lowman, Athena Press, Provo, Utah, 2000, p.147.
<http://www.internmentarchives.com/showdoc.php?docid=416&pagenum=7>

55 WHEREAS, in 1944, the legendary Mike M. Masaoka, a Utah Nisei and Executive
56 Director of the National Japanese American Citizen League, and others, petitioned to have the
57 442nd Regimental Combat Team activated;

The formation of the 442nd Regimental Combat Team was directed by War Department letter dated January 22, 1943. The regiment was activated February 1, 1943.

Source: *Americans: The Story of the 442nd Combat Team*, Orville C. Shirey, Infantry Journal Press, Dec. 1946, p.19.

<http://www.internmentarchives.com/showdoc.php?docid=10&pagenum=9>

58 WHEREAS, during World War II, the 100th Infantry Battalion (100th) and the 442nd
59 Regimental Combat Team (442nd), Nisei soldiers from Hawaii and mainland United States,
60 including Utah, entered combat in the European Theater of War;

61 WHEREAS, many of these soldiers, eventually totaling 13,000, entered military service
62 after being released from concentration camps where they and their families were incarcerated;

The number of soldiers entering military service from relocation centers was not 13,000 as stated but 2,355.

Source: *The Evacuated People*, Dept. of Interior, War Relocation Authority, Govt. Printing Office, June 30, 1946, Fig. 1.

<http://www.internmentarchives.com/showdoc.php?docid=2&pagenum=23>

63 WHEREAS, after 10 days of bitter combat to liberate the towns of Bruyeres, Belmont,
64 and Biffontaine, the 442nd was ordered to effect the rescue of the Texas First Battalion, the 141st
65 Regiment, 36th Division -- known as the Lost Battalion -- who were trapped in the French
66 Vosges Forest occupied by elite German SS soldiers;

The only SS troops mentioned in 442 RCT records or in the regimental history covering October 1944 is the 19th SS Police Regiment, which was one of 11 different German units they came in contact with during October.

Source: 442nd RCT Monthly Report (October 1944), Nov. 15, 1944.

<http://www.internmentarchives.com/specialreports/smithsonian/smithsonian18.php>

67 WHEREAS, after five days of one of the toughest battles of the war, the 100th and the
68 442nd, suffering a combined 814 casualties, including 140 dead, rescued 211 Texans in October
69 1944;

The relief of troops from 1st Bn.141 Inf., while an outstanding feat, was not a battle and certainly was not one of the toughest battles of the war. The casualty count in HCR 5 covers 16 days of heavy fighting. The relief took 5 of those days. Regimental records for Oct 1944 show total casualties for the month as 814: 117 KIA; 639 WIA; 40 MIA and 18 Injured in Action. Only a portion can be attributed to the relief of the "Lost Battalion." It is also important to note that almost all units fought and took casualties solely to defeat the enemy. This action was different in that it also rescued fellow Americans.

Source: 442nd RCT Monthly Report (October 1944), Nov. 15, 1944.

<http://www.internmentarchives.com/specialreports/smithsonian/smithsonian18.php>

70 WHEREAS, about 3,000 riflemen of the 100th and the 442nd accomplished what two
71 divisions, consisting of 40,000 men, could not do in six months, by climbing unrelentingly for 12
72 hours up a 3,000 foot vertical cliff at night on a side the Germans would not expect, and in 32
73 minutes breached the impregnable fortress, the Gothic Line, in Italy;

The 442nd chief mission in this action, according to the unit history, was diversionary, "to draw off some of the enemy's scant central reserve from Bologna prior to the Fifth Army's all-out push in that sector." The plan of action was devised by Col. Miller, Regimental CO and Lt. Col. Pursall, 3rd Bn. CO. It was brilliantly executed by the members of the regiment. However, it took 4 days to accomplish, not 32 minutes. It required some units to climb 2500 feet up steep approaches at night, not a 3,000 foot vertical cliff. The attack was part of a general offensive after months of relative inaction caused by winter weather. The claim two divisions had been fighting and failing over months is a gratuitous calumny not found in the history. The general offensive of which this action was a part took place barely a month before the German surrender.

Source: *Americans: The Story of the 442nd Combat Team*, Orville C. Shirey, Infantry Journal Press, Dec. 1946, pps. 78-86.

<http://www.internmentarchives.com/showdoc.php?docid=10&pagenum=65>

74 WHEREAS, the men of the 100th and 442nd fought in seven major campaigns in Italy
75 and France;

The 100th Bn., which entered combat service long before the rest of the combat team, was in North Africa but did not fight. It took part in the Italian fighting from the beginning. The rest of the combat team was committed to combat on June 25, 1944, after the fall of Rome and served about 10 months.

76 WHEREAS, often referred to as the "Go For Broke Regiment," the soldiers of the 100th
77 and the 442nd suffered extremely heavy casualties, including over 600 killed in action, an
78 extraordinarily high rate of its original infantry strength;

The 442nd did suffer high casualties. 442nd records show 2,381 total casualties between June 25, 1944 and May 12, 1945. This included 409 KIA or DOW (died of wounds). Additionally, there were 904 wounded in action but not hospitalized. These figures do not include casualties sustained by the 100th Bn. which saw service prior to June 25, 1944.

Source: Undated casualty extract, 442nd RCT History.

<http://www.internmentarchives.com/showdoc.php?docid=48&pagenum=1>

79 WHEREAS, on October 21, 1963, Texas Governor John Connolly issued a
 80 proclamation which conferred on the members of the 442nd the state's honorary citizenship;
 81 WHEREAS, the 100th and 442nd became two of the most decorated units in United
 82 States military history in slightly less than two years, with over 18,000 individual and unit
 83 decorations, including the Good Conduct Medal;

The 442nd was a highly decorated unit and was rightly honored for its combat record. However, its number of awards seems to grow with time. The table below lists the numbers given in 1946 in the Regimental History and those given by Mike Masaoka in his book, *They Call Me Moses Masaoka*, by Mike Masaoka with Bill Hosokawa, William Morrow and Company, New York, 1987, p. 177.

Source: *Americans: The Story of the 442nd Combat Team*, p. 101.

<http://www.internmentarchives.com/showdoc.php?docid=10&pagenum=88>

Medals Attributed to the 442d Regimental Combat Team			
	Regimental History 1946	Mike Masaoka 1987	Inflated by %
Distinguished Service Cross	52	52	0%
Silver Stars	354	598	69%
Purple Hearts	3600	9486	164%
Total Individual Awards	3915	18143	363%

84 WHEREAS, among the awards were eight Presidential Unit Citations, 43 Division
 85 Commendations, 13 Army Commendations, two Meritorious Service Unit Plaques, 21
 86 Congressional Medals of Honor, 29 Distinguished Service Crosses, one Distinguished Service
 87 Medal, 560 Silver Stars with 28 Oak Leaf Clusters in lieu of second medals, 22 Legion of Merits,
 88 15 Soldier Medals, more than 4000 Bronze Stars and 1,300 Oak Leaf Clusters, over 4,500 Purple
 89 Hearts including Oak Leaf Clusters, 12 French Croix de Guerre and two Palms to the Croix de
 90 Guerre, and two Italian Medals for Military Valor;

During WW II the 442nd RCT had one award of the Medal of Honor. 56 years later another 20 were awarded followed by one more shortly thereafter. These 21 late awards were the result of political action. In 1996 Sen. Akaka of Hawaii amended the National Defense Authorization Act of 1996 to direct the Secretary of the Army to make a review of Distinguished Service Crosses (the second highest award for valor) awarded to "Asians and Pacific Islanders" and upgrade to Medals of Honor any DSC awards he deemed appropriate. The review revealed 54 DSC awards to Filipino-American soldiers and 47 to those of Japanese ancestry. (The other 5 which made up 52 awards were given to non-Japanese-Americans who made up a majority of the officer leadership in the combat team.) The review also found no indication of discrimination during the war in the awarding of medals for valor. The Secretary of the Army subsequently upgraded 20 Japanese-American DSC awards to Medals of Honor, including Sen. Daniel Inouye of Hawaii. Not one DSC award to a Filipino-American was upgraded.

Source: *Japanese-Americans Get Affirmative Action Medals of Honor*, William J. Hopwood, Cmdr., USNR Ret., April 2007. InternmentArchives.com, Special Reports. <http://www.internmentarchives.com/specialreports/medalofhonor/medalofhonor1.php>

91 WHEREAS, the Nisei Military Intelligence Service (MIS), consisting of over 3,000
92 Japanese Americans, including those from Utah, served in all campaigns in the Pacific Theater of
93 War;

MIS members were a very small part of tactical units. Largely, they translated captured documents, interrogated the rare Japanese captured or who surrendered and talked to civilians urging them to surrender peacefully, etc.

94 WHEREAS, the Nisei MIS conducted highly classified operations and produced tactical
95 intelligence information vital to the United States military's successes, serving as interpreters,
96 translators, interrogators, and communication interceptors in the entire Pacific War, including the
97 Aleutians, China-Burma, East Asia, Guadalcanal, the Phillipines [sic], and Okinawa, and even
98 operated behind enemy lines in Burma and the Phillipines [sic];

99 WHEREAS, after Japan surrendered, the Nisei MIS soldiers, including some from Utah,
100 used their understanding of the culture and ability to build trust to render service that was critical
101 in accomplishing the peaceful transition to a new, democratic government and becoming an
102 important ally to the United States;

103 WHEREAS, the MIS was awarded a Presidential Unit Citation, one Distinguished
104 Service Cross, two Legion of Merits, five Silver Stars, one Soldier's Medal, over 50 Bronze
105 Stars, and 25 Purple Hearts;

106 WHEREAS, Major General Charles A. Willoughby, Chief, Military Intelligence under
107 General Douglas MacArthur, Supreme Military Commander of the Pacific Theater of War,
108 credited the MIS with shortening the Pacific War by two years and saving a million American
109 lives;

That Major General Charles A. Willoughby ever credited the MIS with this monumental achievement is dubious. He does not mention it in his book *MacArthur 1941 - 1951* or in the 4 volume *Reports of General MacArthur* which he edited. To claim that translating captured documents and interrogating prisoners shortened the war by two years and saved a million lives is preposterous. MacArthur's operations officer, Lt. Gen. Chamberlin, did make a similar claim about the work of code breakers which was reasonable considering their profound affect on naval, air and ground operations throughout the war. Japanese-Americans were excluded from code breaking activities with very rare exceptions related to language specialists.

110 WHEREAS, on August 4, 2010, the United States Senate voted unanimously to
111 approve S. 1055, a bill awarding the Congressional Gold Medal collectively to veterans of the
112 100th, the 442nd, and the MIS;

113 WHEREAS, on September 23, 2010, the United States House of Representatives voted
114 unanimously to approve S. 1055, and on October 5, 2010, President Obama signed the bill;

115 WHEREAS, on November 2, 2011, the Congressional Gold Medal was officially
116 presented to the 100th, the 442nd, and the MIS, including the Utah Nisei veterans, and their
117 representatives by the congressional leaders; and

118 WHEREAS, on November 11, 2011, Veterans Day, Governor Herbert honored these
119 veterans in a ceremony at the Utah State Capitol:

120 NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Legislature of the state of Utah, the
121 Governor concurring therein, designates February 18, 2012, as Utah's Congressional Gold Medal
122 Day for the Veterans of the 100th Infantry Battalion, the 442nd Regimental Combat Team, and
123 the Nisei Military Intelligence Service, including those from Utah.

124 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that a copy of this resolution be presented to the
125 representatives of the 100th Infantry Battalion, the 442nd Regimental Combat Team, and the
126 Nisei Military Intelligence Service.